MARK BRNOVICH

1

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

ATTORNEY GENERAL 2 (FIRM STATE BAR NO. 14000) 3 JANE FALLON (BAR NO. 014776) ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL 4 OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL 5 2005 North Central Avenue Phoenix, Arizona 85004-1592 6 Telephone: (602) 542-7972 7 Facsimile: (602) 542-4377 Email: consumer@azag.gov 8 Attorneys for the State of Arizona 9

SUPERIOR COURT OF ARIZONA IN MARICOPA COUNTY

In the Matter of:

BUDGET HEARING AIDS, LLC, an Arizona limited liability company; and AUDIEN LLC, a Wyoming limited liability company and its wholly owned subsidiary, Case No. CV 2021-007536

ASSURANCE OF DISCONTINUANCE

(Assigned to the Hon. Pamela Gates)

Respondent.

The State of Arizona, *ex rel*. Mark Brnovich, the Attorney General (the "State"), and BUDGET HEARING AIDS, LLC, an Arizona limited liability company, and AUDIEN LLC, a Wyoming limited liability company and its wholly owned subsidiary, ("Respondents") agree to the entry of the following Assurance of Discontinuance (the "Assurance") pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1530 of the Arizona Consumer Fraud Act, A.R.S. §§ 44-1521 to -1534 (the "CFA").

1. Plaintiff is the State of Arizona *ex rel*. Mark Brnovich, the Attorney General of Arizona, who is authorized to bring this action under the CFA, A.R.S. §§ 44-1521 to -1534.

2. Respondents are Budget Hearing Aids, LLC, an Arizona limited liability company, and its wholly owned subsidiary, Audien, LLC, a Wyoming limited liability company.

28

3. Budget Hearing Aids LLC ("Budget") began selling hearing devices in October 2019 through Audixhearing.com, a website it owned. In January 2020, Budget shut down Audixhearing.com and began selling hearing devices through Xoomhearing.com, which it also owned. Due to the pandemic, Budget was unable to fill hundreds of orders due to shipping delays from China. As lockdowns in China eased and shipments became available and reliable again, Budget launched Audien LLC ("Audien"), a wholly owned subsidiary of Budget. Audien sells hearing aid devices through its website, Audienhearing.com.

4. As of September 2020, Respondents made sales to approximately 68,000 different customers through its three different websites, Audixhearing.com, Xoomhearing.com, and Audienhearing.com. Respondents currently sell two hearing products that are priced at \$89.00 and \$249.00 per pair.

5. Respondents misled consumers on each of its websites by using the U.S. Food and Drug Administration ("FDA") logo in conjunction with the term "FDA APPROVED." Budget used the FDA logo and the term "FDA APPROVED" on its website, Audixhearing.com, from the time the website launched in October 2019 until Budget shut down the website and replaced it with Xoomhearing.com. Budget used the FDA logo and "FDA APPROVED" on its website Xoomhearing.com from the time the website began until Budget replaced it with Audienhearing.com. Respondents used the FDA logo and the term "FDA APPROVED" on their website Audienhearing.com from the time the website began until September 2020.

6. Respondents then misled consumers on their website, Audienhearing.com, by using the FDA logo in conjunction with the term "FDA REGISTERED" from September 2020 until April 2021.

7. Respondents' use of the term "FDA APPROVED" or "FDA REGISTERED" conveys a message to the public that the FDA favors or endorses a private sector organization or the organization's activities, products, services, and/or personnel (either overtly or tacitly), which FDA does not and cannot do.

8. The State alleges that Respondents' conduct, as described in paragraphs 5 through 7 above, constitutes an unfair and deceptive act and practice in violation of the CFA.

1

2

3

4

-2 -

NOW, THEREFORE, it is hereby agreed as follows:

9. The injunctive relief set forth in paragraph 10 below is binding upon any of the following that receive actual notice of this Assurance through personal service or otherwise: (a) Respondents; (b) their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys; and (c) those persons in active concert or participation with Respondents or any of Respondents' officers, agents, servants, employees, or attorneys.

10. Respondents agree, undertake, and assure that they will stop using the FDA logo in conjunction with the wording "FDA APPROVED" or "FDA REGISTERED" in all advertising, whether online or print-based, now and in the future.

11. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1534, Respondents are liable and obligated to pay to the Attorney General the amount of \$5,840.00 in attorneys' fees and costs due prior to the time of entry of this Assurance, to be deposited into the Consumer Protection-Consumer Fraud Revolving Fund pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1531.01, and used for the purposes set forth therein.

12. The payments required herein shall be paid in the form of cashier's checks or money orders made payable to "The State of Arizona," payment shall be delivered, or mailed and postmarked, to:

Consumer Protection and Advocacy Section The Office of the Arizona Attorney General 2005 N. Central Ave Phoenix, AZ 85004

13. In the event that Respondents commit a material breach of this Assurance, the State may, in its sole discretion, reopen the investigation and/or proceedings and continue with this matter as though this Assurance had not been entered, provided that Respondents shall be entitled to an offset for any amount Respondents already paid to the State under this Consent Judgment.

14. Nothing in this Assurance shall be construed as an approval by the Attorney General, the Court, the State of Arizona, or any agency thereof of Respondents' past, present or future conduct. Respondents shall not represent or imply that the Attorney General, the Court, the State of Arizona, or any agency thereof has approved or approves of any of Respondents' actions or any of Respondents' past, present or future business practices.

-3 -

15. Respondents understand that a violation of this Assurance within six years of the filing thereof constitutes prima facie evidence of a violation of the CFA, pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1530. This Court retains jurisdiction over Respondents and the subject matter of this Assurance for purposes of enabling the State to apply to this Court for the enforcement of Respondents' compliance with this Assurance.

16. This Assurance represents the entire agreement between the parties, and there are no representations, agreements, arrangements, or understandings, oral or written, between the parties relating to the subject matter of this Assurance which are not fully expressed herein or attached hereto.

17. If any portion of this Assurance is held invalid by operation of law, the remaining terms thereof shall not be affected and shall remain in full force and effect.

18. This Assurance is the result of a compromise and settlement agreement between the parties. Only the parties to this action may seek enforcement of this Assurance. Nothing herein is intended to create a private right of action by other parties.

19. This Assurance shall not limit the rights of any private party to pursue any remedies allowed by law.

20. The effective date of this Assurance is the date that it is entered by the court.

21. This Assurance may be executed in counterparts and be delivered by facsimile or electronic transmission, or a copy thereof, such constituting an original counterpart hereof, all of which together will constitute one and the same document.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 10th day of May 2021.

MARK BRNOVICH Attorney General

By: <

Jane Fallon Assistant Attorney General *Attorneys for the State of Arizona*

Date: 5/4/21Budget Hearing Aids, LLC/ By: _____ att Zack Hubbard, Member 4/21 Date: 5 Audien, LLC By: Zack Hubbard, Authorized Signatory Approved as to form and content: Kerry McCue Date: <u>5/4/21</u> and By: David A. Grieme Attorneys for Respondents -5 -