Granted as Submitted

See eSignature page

Clerk of the Superior Court
*** Electronically Filed ***
M. Corriveau, Deputy
1/7/2021 8:00:00 AM
Filing ID 12397763

MARK BRNOVICH
ATTORNEY GENERAL
(Firm State Bar No. 14000)
MATTHEW DU MEE (STATE BAR NO. 028468)
CONSUMER LITIGATION UNIT CHIEF COUNSÉ
OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL
2005 North Central Avenue
Phoenix, AZ 85004-1592
Telephone: (602) 542-7757

IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF ARIZONA

IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF MARICOPA

STATE OF ARIZONA, *ex rel.* MARK BRNOVICH, Attorney General,

Case No. CV2020-017490

Plaintiff,

Facsimile: (602) 542-4377

Attorneys for the State of Arizona

CONSENT JUDGMENT

(Assigned to the Hon. Roger Brodman)

v.

GUARDIAN PROTECTION SERVICES, INC.,

Defendant.

The State of Arizona, *ex rel*. Mark Brnovich, the Attorney General (the "State"), filed a Complaint against Guardian Protection Services, Inc. ("Defendant") alleging violations of the Arizona Consumer Fraud Act, A.R.S. §§ 44-1521–1534 (the "CFA"). Defendant has waived service of the Complaint, has been advised of the right to a trial in this matter, and has waived the same. Defendant admits the jurisdiction of this Court over the subject matter and parties, stipulates that this Court may enter the following Consent Judgment, and acknowledges that this Court will retain jurisdiction for the purpose of enforcing this Consent Judgment. Defendant has consented and stipulated to entry of this Consent Judgment to compromise and settle claims in

///

connection with an investigation under the CFA and not out of any admission of guilt, wrongdoing, violation, or sanction.

PARTIES

- 1. The State is authorized to bring this action under the CFA.
- 2. Defendant is a Pennsylvania corporation doing business in Arizona. Its corporate headquarters is located at 174 Thorn Hill Rd., Warrendale, PA 15086.
- 3. This Court has jurisdiction over the Complaint and the parties as is necessary for the Court to enter this Consent Judgment and any orders hereafter appropriate pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1528 and this Consent Judgment.
 - 4. Venue is proper in Maricopa County pursuant to A.R.S. § 12-401(17).

FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

- 5. The State alleges that:
 - a. Defendant, directly and/or indirectly through its agents (which the State contends includes third parties referred to as dealers), convinced Arizona consumers to enter into contracts with unfair provisions pertaining to advertising, selling, installing, monitoring and servicing electronic security systems to consumers, including non-disclosure or inadequate disclosure of automatic renewal terms; non-disclosure of options for canceling; non-disclosure of early termination fees; and early termination fees that bore no relationship to any amount lost or incurred by Defendant as a result of the customer's termination of services.
 - b. Defendant misrepresented its inability to cancel some consumers' contracts after the consumers complained of deceptive, unfair and/or fraudulent acts, practices and/or omissions during the advertisement and/or sale of their security systems.
 - c. Defendant required consumers to pay substantial early termination fees for canceling their contracts, equaling the amount covering the entire remaining period of consumers' contracts, regardless of the size of that amount or its relationship to Defendant's expenses.

///

- 6. Defendant denies the allegations in paragraphs 5.a., 5.b., and 5.c. and denies that it has engaged in any unlawful conduct, but has agreed to the entry of this Consent Judgment in order to avoid the expense and uncertainty of litigation. The agreement to enter this Consent Judgment is not and shall not be construed as an admission by Defendant of any liability or wrongdoing. The terms of the Consent Judgment shall not be cited as evidence of wrongdoing by Defendant, its successors, or assigns.
- 7. This Consent Judgment satisfies and extinguishes all Consumer Fraud Act claims which could be brought by the State of Arizona, up to the time the Complaint was filed, arising from or relating to the allegations and contracts referenced in paragraph 5.a., 5.b., and 5.c.

ORDER

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND AGREED:

- 8. The injunctive relief set forth in paragraph 9 of this Consent Judgment is binding upon any of the following that receive actual notice of this Consent Judgment through personal service or otherwise: (1) Defendant; (2) its officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys; and (3) those persons in active concert or participation with Defendant or any of its officers, agents, servants, employees, or attorneys.
- 9. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1528, for contracts entered into on or after the date of this Consent Judgment, Defendant is permanently enjoined, restrained and prohibited from: imposing on, or collecting from, any any residential customer located in Arizona who wants to terminate his/her sales or monitoring contract with Defendant an "early termination fee" or other similar charge without clearly and conspicuously disclosing that charge in the terms of the applicable contract(s) and requiring the customer to initial next to that charge.

PAYMENT

10. Prior to the filing of this Consent Judgment, pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1528(A)(2), Defendant shall pay to a claims administrator selected by the Attorney General pursuant to paragraph 13 the amount of \$227,558.53 in restitution. The Attorney General's Office shall direct the timing of this payment and shall file this Consent Judgment within ten (10) days of the claims administrator confirming its receipt of this payment.

- 11. Prior to the filing of this Consent Judgment, pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1531(A), Defendant shall pay to the Attorney General the amount of \$200,000.00 in civil penalties to be deposited into the Consumer Protection-Consumer Fraud Revolving Fund pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1531.01, and used for the purposes set forth therein. The Attorney General's Office shall direct the timing of this payment and shall file this Consent Judgment within ten (10) days of receipt of this payment.
- 12. In addition to the amounts provided for in Paragraphs 10 and 11, Defendant will pay for the cost of the claims administrator selected by the Attorney General pursuant to paragraph 13 to administer restitution payments.
- 13. The Attorney General will have the discretion to select a claims administrator. Defendant will have the right to approve or reject the Attorney General's selection, but such approval may not be unreasonably withheld. Defendant will pay the claims administrator the total restitution amount and additional payments for the administrator's costs prior to the entry of the Consent Judgment. The restitution amount will be held in escrow by the claims administrator until the entry of the Consent Judgment. Defendant agrees to provide all necessary consumer information in its possession to cooperate with the claims administrator in furtherance of these restitution payments.
- 14. The total restitution payment amount will be distributed to the previously identified 603 Arizona consumers who paid more than \$500 for Defendant's early termination fee such that each of the 603 consumers receives the amount over \$500 that they paid for early termination. Should monies remain from the total amount allocated for restitution, the remaining amount will be transferred by the claims administrator to the State to be deposited in the Consumer Protection-Consumer Fraud Revolving Fund pursuant to A.R.S. § 44-1531.01, and used for the purposes set forth therein.

GENERAL PROVISIONS

15. Nothing in this Consent Judgment will be construed as an approval by the Attorney General, the Court, the State of Arizona, or any agency thereof of Defendant's past, present, or future conduct. Defendant must not represent or imply that the Attorney General, the Court, the

	3
	4
	5
	6
	7
	8
	9
1	0
1	1
1	
1	3
1	4
1	5
	6
1	7
	8
	9
2	0
2	1
2	2
2	3
2	4
2	5
2	6
2	7
2	8

2

State of Arizona, or any agency thereof has approved or approves of any of Defendant's actions or any of Defendant's past, present or future business practices.

- 16. This Consent Judgment represents the entire agreement between the parties, and there are no representations, agreements, arrangements, or understandings, oral or written, between the parties relating to the subject matter of this Consent Judgment which are not fully expressed herein or attached hereto.
- 17. If any immaterial portion of this Consent Judgment is held invalid by operation of law, the remaining terms thereof will not be affected and will remain in full force and effect.
- 18. Jurisdiction is retained by this Court for the purpose of entertaining an application by the State or Defendant for the enforcement of this Consent Judgment.
- 19. This Consent Judgment is the result of a compromise and settlement agreement between the parties. Only the State or the Defendant may seek enforcement of this Consent Judgment. Nothing herein is intended to create a private right of action by other parties.
- 20. The effective date of this Consent Judgment is the date that it is entered by the Court.
- 21. This Consent Judgment may be executed by the parties in counterparts and be delivered by facsimile or electronic transmission, or a copy thereof, such constituting an original counterpart hereof, all of which together will constitute one and the same document.
- 22. This Consent Judgment resolves all outstanding claims in this action on all remedies provided under the CFA against the Defendant. As no further matters remain pending, this is a final judgment entered pursuant to Ariz. R. Civ. P. 54(c).

DATED this	day of	, 20	
		HID OF OF THE CLIDED LOD COL	

JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

CONSENT TO JUDGMENT

- 1. Defendant acknowledges that it has waived service of the Summons and Complaint, has read the Consent Judgment, and is aware of its right to a trial in this matter and has waived the same.
- 2. Defendant admits the jurisdiction of this Court, and consent to the entry of the foregoing Consent Judgment.
- 3. Defendant states that no promise of any kind or nature whatsoever was made to induce it to enter into this Consent Judgment and declares that it has entered into this Consent Judgment voluntarily.
- 4. This Consent Judgment is entered as a result of a compromise and a settlement agreement between the parties. Only the State or the Defendant may seek enforcement of this Consent Judgment. Nothing herein is intended to create a private right of action by other parties; however, this Consent Judgment does not limit the rights of any private party to pursue any remedies allowed by law.
- 5. Defendant acknowledges that its acceptance of this Consent Judgment is only for the purpose of resolving the ongoing inquiry and lawsuit filed by the State, and further acknowledges that this Consent Judgment does not preclude any agency or officer of this State or subdivision thereof from instituting other proceedings, if appropriate.
- 6. This Consent to Judgment may be executed in counterparts and be delivered by facsimile or electronic transmission, or a copy thereof, such constituting an original counterpart hereof, all of which together will constitute one and the same document.
- 7. Defendant represents and warrants that the person signing below on its behalf is duly appointed and authorized to do so.

DATED this 9th day of December, 2020.

1	Guardian Protection Services, Inc. By:			
2				
3				
4		by. <u>13000</u>		
5				
6				
7	APPROVED AS TO FORM AND CONTENT:			
8	MARK BRNOVICH	Mitchell Stein Carey Chapman, PC		
9	Attorney General			
10				
11				
12		anne Chapman		
13	1-2 10-2			
14	By: Matthew du Mag Unit Chief Councel	Anna M. Chanman, Egg		
15	Matthew du Mee, Unit Chief Counsel Attorney for the State of Arizona	Anne M. Chapman, Esq. Attorney for Defendant		
16		·		
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				

eSignature Page 1 of 1

Filing ID: 12397763 Case Number: CV2020-017490 Original Filing ID: 12383277

Granted as Submitted



ENDORSEMENT PAGE

CASE NUMBER: CV2020-017490 SIGNATURE DATE: 1/6/2021

E-FILING ID #: 12397763 FILED DATE: 1/7/2021 8:00:00 AM

MATTHEW B DU MEE

GUARDIAN PROTECTION SERVICES INC 174 THORN HILL RD WARRENDALE PA 15086