

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD:
SUBCOMMITTEE ON HATE-BASED CRIMES AND ANTISEMITIC INCIDENTS

Minutes of Public Meeting (Held via Zoom)

April 7, 2025

Subcommittee Members Present (by Zoom)

Vice Mayor Holli Ploog (Chairperson)
Dr. Heather M. Ross (Vice Chairperson)
Det. Nancy Spina
Det. Michael Hillman
Spec. Agent Daniel Johnson

Staff Members Present (by Zoom)

Nate Anbar (Executive Office Liaison)
Julie Blumenreich (ACRAB Counsel)
Dave Harvey (AGO Law Enforcement Liaison)

I. Call to Order

Chairperson Ploog called the meeting to order at 3:04 pm. The meeting took place via Zoom.

II. Approval of Minutes

The minutes from the previous meeting, held on March 3, 2025, were brought up for approval. The minutes were approved unanimously.

III. Introductory Remarks

Chairperson Ploog made brief introductory remarks.

IV. Topics for Discussion and Possible Action

a. Recap regarding Subcommittee deliverables.

Chairperson Ploog noted that the Subcommittee would mainly be discussing the community survey and law enforcement stakeholder events, as well as measures to drive further interest in the latter.

b. Discussion regarding survey questions and contact list.

Vice Chairperson Ross discussed how she had put the survey questions into the Qualtrics web application and invited members to test them to ensure compatibility. Chairperson Ploog and Subcommittee Staff had received the link to these prior to the meeting and agreed to share it with members after the meeting. Chairperson Ploog asked Vice Chairperson Ross to review the survey questions with members during the meeting.

Vice Chairperson Ross narrated the survey as shown in the Qualtrics web application, while allowing members to offer commentary. For the first question, Chairperson Ploog considered that it might be worded too generally. However, Members Johnson and Spina stated that they thought it provided a good baseline for responses as written. For the second question, Vice Chairperson Ross noted that the survey would repeat specific definitions such as for the term “community” in the survey preamble and in individual questions. Vice Chairperson Ross also noted that several questions contain branching logic,

MEETING MINUTES

Arizona Civil Rights Advisory Board:

Subcommittee on Hate-Based Crimes and Antisemitic Incidents, April 7, 2025

whereby answering one way or another may lead to different follow up questions. As a result, members determined that questions would not be numbered in the survey itself. Members agreed that for certain questions an answer of “none” or “unsure” should be added to allow for greater precision in answering, and this was applied to the second question. For the third question, Member Spina also noted that “unsure” should be added as an option. Member Hillman noted that questions allowing for multiple selections should indicate this and Vice Chairperson Ross agreed to add that language where relevant. Questions 4 and 5 did not receive any feedback from members. For question 6 Chairperson Ploog suggested that the prompt could be unclear to some respondents. Vice Chairperson Ross and Member Spina agreed that certain terms such as “crime” should have definitions provided to ensure consistency in responses. Members agreed these definitions should be provided in the text of the question. Member Spina noted that her agency, the Mesa Police Department, maintains public guidance on similar topics and Member Johnson located and shared this with the Subcommittee. Vice Chairperson Ross agreed to use this as a starting point and noted that she would send her revisions to Staff for review and eventual incorporation into the survey. Member Hillman noted that a “back arrow” option should be added to all questions, and other members agreed. The remaining survey questions did not prompt any substantive feedback by members. Vice Chairperson Ross noted that the concluding message of the survey might provide more information about the Subcommittee and its work. Chairperson Ploog noted that an introduction might also do so and the two should complement one another. Staff noted that they will put together a draft introduction this week. Vice Chairperson Ross also suggested including in the survey an option for respondents to leave additional contact information.

Chairperson Ploog then inquired with Staff as to the status of the contact list. Subcommittee Staff noted that work was proceeding but that more contacts were needed from Southern Arizona. Staff noted that they had reached out to a community partner to try to obtain more information. Chairperson Ploog agreed to also reach out to that community partner and also noted that she would like to see more schools on the list. Staff agreed to review the initial directory used in compiling the list and to add schools originally left off so as to avoid duplicating contacts with the religious institutions that oversee the schools.

c. Discussion of upcoming law enforcement forums and preparation for said forums.

Chairperson Ploog noted that the invitations to the law enforcement stakeholder events had not yielded sufficient responses. Staff noted that four responses had so far been received, including three for April 22, one for April 23 and zero for May 6. Chairperson Ploog noted that the event on April 23 might have to be rescheduled if it generates insufficient attendance.

Chairperson Ploog then opened the floor to ideas for how to generate more responses, inviting Dave Harvey, the Arizona Attorney General’s Office’s Law Enforcement Liaison, to share his thoughts.

Law Enforcement Liaison Harvey briefly introduced himself and noted that after the meeting he would discuss with other AGO and Subcommittee Staff. He then discussed

MEETING MINUTES

Arizona Civil Rights Advisory Board:
Subcommittee on Hate-Based Crimes and Antisemitic Incidents, April 7, 2025

various statewide law enforcement organizations that might be helpful in disseminating the invitation. He also noted that often when he communicates with Sheriffs or Chiefs of Police he includes an opening line asking them to forward to the appropriate staff member in their agency. He suggested first reaching out to the Anti-Defamation League (ADL) to see if they might assist in sending the invitation to their law enforcement contacts. Members Hillman and Johnson also noted that they had contacts with the ADL that may be helpful. Member Spina stated that she would also see about sending another reminder message to TLOs.

Given the mention of the ADL, Chairperson Ploog and Vice Chairperson Ross noted that since the Attorney General is scheduled to speak at an upcoming ADL event she might touch upon the Subcommittee's work to generate additional interest in the stakeholder meetings. Staff stated that they would inquire about this possibility with the Attorney General's Communications Team. Members Hillman and Johnson noted that they would also be speaking at the event and would make a note to mention the Subcommittee's work as well.

With respect to facilitation of the stakeholder events, Chairperson Ploog and Vice Chairperson Ross suggested that members who want to serve as facilitators hold a special meeting. ACRA Counsel Julie Blumenreich cautioned that this would need to be noticed as a formal meeting given the anticipated presence of a quorum of the Subcommittee. Staff agreed and noted that they would ensure this requirement was met.

d. Discussion of current events potentially relevant to the subcommittee's purpose and anticipated deliverables.

Vice Chairperson Ross thanked staff for recently sharing news articles regarding a letter from Jewish faculty and Jewish organizations at ASU regarding federal funding, noting that as a faculty member herself she has felt supported by her institution's administration.

e. Scheduling of future meetings.

Chairperson Ploog suggested that the Subcommittee hold a special meeting to plan for the facilitation of the stakeholder events. Members agreed that this would take place over Zoom on Thursday, April 17 at 3 pm.

Staff suggested pushing back the next regular meeting given its proximity to the final stakeholder event. Members agreed that the meeting should be moved to Friday, May 9 at 2 pm. Chairperson Ploog noted that this change would provide members a chance to "debrief" after final stakeholder event.

V. Staff Report

Subcommittee staff noted that they will draft a preamble message for survey and add to the survey contact list as they receive additional information. Staff will also review the initial directory used to compile the contact list for additional educational institutions that can be added to the

MEETING MINUTES

Arizona Civil Rights Advisory Board: Subcommittee on Hate-Based Crimes and Antisemitic Incidents, April 7, 2025

list. Staff will inquire with the AGO Communications Team about The Attorney General's upcoming speech to the ADL. Staff noted that they will work with Member Spina to send a reminder message to TLOs. Subcommittee Staff will also work with Law Enforcement Liaison Harvey and Member Johnson on sending the invitation to law enforcement through other contacts.

VI. Call to the Public

Chairperson Ploog read the statutory admonition regarding public comments. Jessica Dudley, a resident of Chandler, Arizona signed in to provide comment as a member of the public. Ms. Dudley noted that she is interested in the topic addressed by the Subcommittee and that she would follow up by email with questions for Subcommittee Staff.

VII. Adjournment

Chairperson Ploog called for a motion to adjourn. The motion was approved unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at 4:38 pm. A special meeting of the Subcommittee will be held on Thursday, April 17 at 3 pm. The next regular meeting of the Subcommittee will be held on Friday, May 9 at 2:00 p.m.