

DRAFT

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD:
SUBCOMMITTEE ON HATE-BASED CRIMES AND ANTISEMITIC INCIDENTS

Minutes of Public Meeting (Held via Zoom)

April 17, 2025

Subcommittee Members Present (by Zoom)

Vice Mayor Holli Ploog (Chairperson)
Dr. Heather M. Ross (Vice Chairperson)
Det. Nancy Spina
Det. Michael Hillman
Spec. Agent Daniel Johnson

Staff Members Present (by Zoom)

Nate Anbar (Executive Office Liaison)
Leslie Ross (ACRAB Executive Director)

I. Call to Order

Chairperson Ploog called the meeting to order at 3:05 pm. The meeting took place via Zoom. There was a quorum present.

II. Introductory Remarks

Chairperson Ploog made brief introductory remarks regarding a recent ADL event at which several Subcommittee members were present.

III. Topics for Discussion and Possible Action

a. Discussion and planning regarding upcoming law enforcement stakeholder events and facilitation thereof.

Chairperson Ploog noted that a request to disseminate stakeholder event invitations was sent to the ADL. Staff noted that they had not heard back but that additional signups had been prompted with the help of AGO Law Enforcement Liaison Dave Harvey. Vice Chairperson Ross offered to also reach out to her ADL contacts.

Chairperson Ploog suggested using draft questions from the previously considered law enforcement survey to frame stakeholder event conversations. Subcommittee Staff shared their screen with the draft questions and members discussed. Executive Director Ross suggested the Subcommittee use open ended questions. Vice Chairperson Ross suggested that members maintain the top-line wording of some questions and use others for follow-up questions. Vice Chairperson Ross also noted that facilitators should also sometimes build off earlier responses with their questions, e.g. by saying "tell me more." Members agreed that it was also important to consider time constraints. Member Spina pointed out that, with that in mind, the initial number of draft questions was too high. Members agreed to limit the document to five main questions - and to keep questions specific to antisemitism. Vice Chairperson Ross noted that questions should broadly elicit information about what law enforcement is doing on the issue of antisemitic crimes and incidents, barriers they face, and their perception of barriers faced by the community.

DRAFT MINUTES

Arizona Civil Rights Advisory Board:
Subcommittee on Hate-Based Crimes and Antisemitic Incidents, April 17, 2025

For the question regarding FBI and ADPS reporting, members suggested narrowing the language and adding follow-up questions regarding resources and challenges. Vice Chairperson Ross suggested two follow-up questions starting more broadly and then narrowing. Member Spina noted that reporting is more of a records matter than a command staff matter and that not all attendees will necessarily be aware of this information for their agency. Members agreed that the question should be worded to prompt detailed discussion and capture nuance while avoiding incomplete “yes or no” answers.

Chairperson Ploog asked if the document needed an opening. Vice Chairperson Ross suggested adding a preamble, including a thank you to attendees and statement about what members hope to learn. For the question regarding community relationships, Member Hillman suggested adding a follow-up question to clarify whether relationships existed before or after 10/7/2023. Member Johnson also discussed sharpening the language to ensure answers are relevant to law enforcement work.

Chairperson Ploog shifted to discussing the question regarding non-criminal incidents. Member Johnson stated that he is unsure attendees would be able to answer. Vice Chairperson Ross suggested broadening the question to compensate for this.

Members also agreed to add a question from the original survey draft regarding community forums as a follow-up to the question about community relationships, and to add follow-up questions about underreporting issues and possible solutions under questions regarding reporting of criminal and non-criminal incidents respectively. Chairperson Ploog noted that some of these questions are open-ended and asked law enforcement members if they thought that was appropriate. Member Spina noted that open-ended questions are not detrimental in a stakeholder meeting setting even though they may be problematic in a survey. Members agreed to add an additional open-ended question soliciting feedback on anything important that had not already been discussed.

Member Spina noted that there may be an issue if attendees are not aware of the legal landscape around hate crime and bias enhancement laws in Arizona. Staff asked if language explaining this might be added to the preamble. Member Spina suggested instead adding it to a separate question. Staff drafted a question but Vice Chairperson Ross and Member Hillman suggested putting this at the end and only asking it if the meeting does not run out of time. Members agreed with this course of action.

Chairperson Ploog reminded members that two stakeholder events are set for the following week and that it would be helpful for law enforcement members to help facilitate. Member Johnson noted his willingness, but indicated that he would only be present at the event on 5/6. Member Hillman agreed to facilitate the other two sessions. Vice Chairperson Ross made members aware that she would not be able to attend the 4/23 session. Executive Director Ross noted her intention to attend all three. Chairperson Ploog stated that in terms of structure, she would provide introductions at the start of each session and then turn things over to Member Hillman, who would read the questions.

DRAFT MINUTES

Arizona Civil Rights Advisory Board:
Subcommittee on Hate-Based Crimes and Antisemitic Incidents, April 17, 2025

b. Discussion regarding the planned community survey.

Chairperson Ploog inquired about the status of the community survey. Staff noted that the contact list is coming along, but that they have not heard back from a community partner from whom they had hoped to obtain additional contact information. Chairperson Ploog noted that she would share the email address for another member of that organization. Staff stated that they would hopefully have a survey introduction written and a contact list finalized by the week of 4/28.

IV. Staff Report

Subcommittee staff stated that after the conclusion of the meeting they would work on preambles for the community survey and stakeholder questions, send stakeholder questions to members, and compile a list of event RSVPs for members.

V. Call to the Public

No members of the public were present.

VI. Adjournment

Chairperson Ploog moved to adjourn. The meeting was adjourned at 4:48 pm. Stakeholder meetings will be held on Tuesday, April 22 at 9:00 a.m., Wednesday, April 23 at 9:00 a.m., and Tuesday, May 6 at 3:00 p.m. The next regular meeting of the Subcommittee will be held on Friday, May 9 at 2:00 p.m.