

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD:
SUBCOMMITTEE ON HATE-BASED CRIMES AND ANTISEMITIC INCIDENTS

Minutes of Public Meeting (Held via Zoom)

January 6, 2025

Subcommittee Members Present (by Zoom)

Vice Mayor Holli Ploog (Chairperson)
Dr. Heather M. Ross (Vice Chairperson)
Det. Nancy Spina
Det. Michael Hillman
Spec. Agent Daniel Johnson
Daniel Hernandez

Staff Members Present (by Zoom)

Nate Anbar (Executive Liaison)
Julie Blumenreich (ACRAB Counsel)
Sophia Braham (ACRAB Executive Liaison)

I. Call to Order.

Chairperson Ploog called the meeting to order at 3:03 pm. The meeting took place via Zoom.

II. Approval of Minutes

The minutes from the previous meeting, held on December 2, 2024, were introduced with a minor typographical revision. Vice Chairperson Ross made a motion to approve the minutes as amended, which Member Johnson seconded. The minutes as amended were approved unanimously.

III. Introductory Remarks

Chairperson Ploog made brief introductory remarks.

IV. Overview of Subcommittee Member Obligations

Chairperson Ploog called for a motion to enter executive session for the purpose of discussing the legal obligations of Subcommittee Members with counsel. Vice Chairperson Ross made a motion to enter executive session pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3) to discuss legal advice with the attorney for the Subcommittee, which Member Hernandez seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

The public meeting resumed at 3:32 pm.

V. Topics for Discussion and Possible Action.

a. Recap of Subcommittee goals and previously discussed ideas and deliverables.

Chairperson Ploog described the survey and report previously discussed as deliverables.

b. Discussion of information already obtained by Subcommittee members and next steps.

Chairperson Ploog asked Subcommittee Staff to comment on any progress made towards the discussed deliverables. Staff noted that Vice Chairperson Ross had identified and

MEETING MINUTES

Arizona Civil Rights Advisory Board:
Subcommittee on Hate-Based Crimes and Antisemitic Incidents, January 6, 2025

obtained access to a survey instrument and that Members Johnson and Spina had shared previously discussed materials to inform the eventual survey questions and contact list.

Members discussed the timing of the survey and noted that some follow-up would likely be needed. Vice Chairperson Ross noted that 2-3 days is typical for follow-up and 2 weeks for closure of a survey, while the ability to track responses can allow for flexibility.

Chairperson Ploog asked for ideas on how survey questions should be decided. Staff suggested that members send possible ideas to staff for compilation. Vice Chairperson Ross noted that given the short timeline, possible questions should be discussed starting at this meeting, and that a short survey is ideal. Members agreed on some keywords to inform potential questions and that it would be appropriate to ask community groups an open-ended question seeking general suggestions.

Chairperson Ploog discussed possible means of sending the survey and the potential to submit part of it using public records requests. Members discussed and concluded that public records requests would take significant time and not necessarily address the desired information. Data on overall incident occurrence can be found separately or requested from law enforcement through a simple survey, which can also solicit information on law enforcement and public perceptions. Members agreed that separate surveys would be needed for community organizations/leaders and law enforcement. Members also discussed the need to create an introductory letter for the survey. Members Johnson and Hillman discussed publicly available data that they can provide from their agencies.

Members each agreed to provide staff with a few possible questions for the law enforcement and community group surveys within a week of this meeting. Staff will send a reminder the Friday after this meeting.

c. Discussion of current events potentially relevant to the subcommittee's purpose and anticipated deliverables.

Chairperson Ploog discussed a recent incident in which the City of Sedona received antisemitic comments about the public placement of a menorah. Chairperson Ploog also brought up a situation regarding a painting displayed at the University of Arizona (UA) Art Museum, which many viewers described as antisemitic. Member Hernandez noted that he was aware of this situation and that he was informed that the new UA President would be meeting with local community leaders. Member Hernandez also noted that he would follow up with a member of the public who had been present to speak on this topic, but who left the meeting prior to call to the public.

d. Scheduling of future meetings.

Due to a scheduling conflict, members agreed to deviate from the regular meeting schedule for the month of February. The next meeting of the Subcommittee was rescheduled to Monday, February 10, 2025 at 11:00 am. Future regular meetings will return to the previous schedule and will be held on the first Monday of each month at 3:00 pm.

MEETING MINUTES

Arizona Civil Rights Advisory Board:
Subcommittee on Hate-Based Crimes and Antisemitic Incidents, January 6, 2025

VI. Staff Report

Subcommittee Staff noted that in addition to the items discussed previously, for the purpose of creating a contact list, it would be helpful to receive from members lists of any community leaders or organizations with whom they have specific connections. Staff also discussed the timeline for review of the final survey questions and contact list by the Attorney General's Office. Members and staff agreed that members will send possible questions within a week, staff will take a week to compile a question list, Vice Chairperson Ross will then review and revise this list within a third week, after which the Attorney General's Office will review the final list in advance of the next Subcommittee meeting.

VII. Call to the Public

No members of the public were present at the time that call to the public was announced.

VIII. Adjournment

Chairperson Ploog called for a motion to adjourn, which Member Johnson offered and Member Hillman seconded. The motion was approved unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at 4:45 pm. The next meeting of the Subcommittee will be held on Monday, February 10, 2025 at 11:00 am.