

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of Telephonic Public Meeting

February 19, 2021

Board Members Present by Telephone

Tarah L. White (Chairperson)
Joshua W. Carden (Vice-Chairperson)
Grant H. Frazier
Karen J. Hartman-Tellez
Moses Sanchez

Staff Members Present by Telephone

Rebekah Browder (Executive Director)
Leslie Ross (Legal Counsel)
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

Members of the Public Present by Telephone

Lydia Lindsmeier

a. Call to Order.

Tarah White called the meeting to order at 12:29 p.m. The meeting took place telephonically with all in attendance announcing their presence.

b. Preliminary Remarks.

Tarah White greeted the members and the new members.

c. Introductions of the New Members

The Board members and staff members briefly introduced themselves and gave a brief background.

d. Approval of Meeting Minutes of May 8, 2020.

Karen Hartman-Tellez moved to approve the meeting minutes from May 8, 2020. Joshua Carden seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

e. Division Report

Rebekah Browder gave the Division Report. Ms. Browder informed Board of the trends of cases the Division has seen in the past seven months since the Board met, the new English/Spanish Division pamphlet, and new compliance officers to focus on housing cases. Discussion was held about disability cases and housing complaints with the Division. The Division also discussed a housing outreach the Division is planning. The Board requested to add housing COVID issues on the agenda for the next meeting.

f. Law Enforcement Survey.

Tarah White and Joshua Carden informed the Board of the Law Enforcement Survey and the status. Tarah White and Joshua Carden will work together on a final report and present to the Board members at a future meeting.

g. Call to the Public.

No members of the public addressed the Board.

h. Project ideas.

Discussion was held about ongoing project ideas.

- Tarah White and Joshua Carden informed the Board of the Human Trafficking bill (HB2116) and its progress in the legislature.
- The Board discussed service animals related to housing and public accommodations. The Board discussed reaching out to the Chamber of Commerce to see what the needs are and potential outreach through social media. Grant Frazier agreed to draft a letter to the chamber for the Board to review at the next meeting.
- The other items were tabled for future meetings.

i. Call to the Board.

There were no current events discussed by the Board.

j. Meeting Schedule

The Board agreed to keep the meetings scheduled to the second Friday of every month.

k. Adjournment.

Karen Hartman-Tellez moved to adjourn the meeting, and Moses Sanchez seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 1:43 p.m.

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of Telephonic Public Meeting

March 12, 2021

Board Members Present by Telephone

Tarah L. White (Chairperson)
Grant H. Frazier
Karen J. Hartman-Tellez
Moses Sanchez
Maddalena Savary

Staff Members Present by Telephone

Rebekah Browder (Executive Director)
Leslie Ross (Legal Counsel)
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

Board Members Absent:

Joshua W. Carden (Vice-Chairperson)

a. Call to Order.

Tarah White called the meeting to order at 12:35 p.m. The meeting took place telephonically with each in attendance announcing his/her presence.

b. Preliminary Remarks.

Tarah White greeted the members.

c. Introductions of the New Members

Newly appointed member Maddalena Savary introduced herself.

d. Approval of Meeting Minutes of February 19, 2021.

Karen Hartman-Tellez moved to approve the meeting minutes from February 19, 2021. Moses Sanchez seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

e. Board Elections

Discussion was held regarding board elections. Moses Sanchez moved to elect Karen Hartman-Tellez as Board Chairperson. Grant Frazier seconded. A vote was held and the motion passed unanimously. Moses Sanchez moved to elect Tarah White as Vice-Chairperson. Karen Hartman-Tellez seconded. A vote was held and the motion passed unanimously.

f. Division Report

Rebekah Browder and Leslie Ross gave the Division Report. Ms. Browder informed Board of the concerns of the housing moratorium ending on April 1, 2021 and pending evictions due to non-payment of rent. Ms. Ross discussed concerns related to the eviction process.

g. Law Enforcement Survey.

Tarah White informed the Board that she and Joshua Carden are still working on the numbers and they will report back soon.

h. Human Trafficking Bill Status

Maddalena Savary informed the Board that the bill is up for a third read before the senate on 3/15/2021.

i. Call to the Public.

No members of the public addressed the Board.

j. Project ideas.

Discussion was held about ongoing project ideas.

- Covid-19 Housing Training: Discussion was held about community stakeholders in fair housing. Moses Sanchez moved to have Karen Hartman-Tellez invite representatives from Community Legal Services, Southwest Fair Housing Council, and Arizona Center for Disability Law to address the Board during the April meeting. Grant Frazier seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- Discussion was held on the topic of GINA employment laws and wellness programs. The Board members will look at the laws and discuss further at the next meeting.
- Discussion was held regarding the letter Grant Frazier drafted to send to the Arizona Restaurant Association regarding service animals. The Board had a few suggestions and edits. Moses Sanchez moved to approve the letter to send subject to small grammatical changes. Karen Hartman-Tellez seconded. The motion passed unanimously. Moses Sanchez moved to send the edited letter to the Arizona Restaurant Association. Karen Hartman-Tellez seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- Discussion was held about the other project ideas on the agenda. The Board discussed moving forward with public encounters with law enforcement. Moses Sanchez moved to make public encounters with law enforcement a project for the current year. Karen Hartman-Tellez seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

k. Call to the Board.

There were no current events discussed by the Board.

l. Adjournment.

Karen Hartman-Tellez moved to adjourn the meeting, and Moses Sanchez seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 1:43 p.m.

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of Public Meeting

April 9, 2021

Board Members Present by Zoom

Karen J. Hartman-Tellez (Chairperson)
Carol Berry
Joshua W. Carden
Grant H. Frazier
Moses Sanchez
Maddalena Savary

Staff Members Present by Zoom

Rebekah Browder (Executive Director)
Leslie Ross (Legal Counsel)
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

Board Members Absent

Tarah White (Vice-Chairperson)

a. Call to Order.

Karen Hartman-Tellez called the meeting to order at 12:31 p.m. The meeting took place via Zoom.

b. Preliminary Remarks.

Karen Hartman-Tellez greeted the members.

c. Introductions of the New Members.

Newly appointed member Carol Berry introduced herself.

d. Approval of Meeting Minutes of March 12, 2021.

Maddalena Savary moved to approve the meeting minutes from March 12, 2021. Moses Sanchez seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

e. Housing Presentations from Invited Groups.

Community partners Stanley Silas and Jeff Katz from Community Legal Services, and Jay Young from Southwest Fair Housing Council, presented current issues in Fair Housing to the Board.

f. Division Report.

Rebekah Browder gave the Division Report. Ms. Browder informed Board of the Division's current litigation. Ms. Browder also informed the Board that the Division had a large number of mask complaints based on religion and disability.

g. HB2116 Human Trafficking Bill status.

Rebekah Browder reported that the bill passed and was signed by Governor Ducey.

h. Certificates of Appreciation for Former Board Members.

The Board discussed sending certificates of appreciation to Robert Garcia, Rachel Frazier Johnson, and Sandy Flynn. Josh Carden moved to issue the certificates and Moses Sanchez seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

i. Call to the Public.

No members of the public addressed the Board.

j. Project ideas.

Discussion was held about ongoing project ideas.

- COVID issues in Housing: Members of the Board discussed reaching out to other stakeholders related to housing issues during COVID.
- GINA and Employee Wellness Programs: this issue was tabled for a future meeting.
- Assistance/service animals in public accommodations and housing: The Board's letter was mailed last month to the Arizona Restaurant Association. The Division will send a revised letter with Rebekah Browder's contact information.
- The other issues on the agenda were tabled for a future meeting.

k. Call to the Board.

There were no current events discussed by the Board.

l. Open Meeting Law Presentation.

Leslie Ross and Karen Hartman-Tellez presented the laws related to Open Meetings to the Board.

m. Adjournment.

Maddalena Savary moved to adjourn the meeting, and Joshua Carden seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 2:18 p.m.

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of Public Meeting

May 14, 2021

Board Members Present by Zoom

Karen J. Hartman-Tellez (Chairperson)
Tarah White (Vice-Chairperson)
Carol Berry
Grant H. Frazier
Moses Sanchez

Staff Members Present by Zoom

Rebekah Browder (Executive Director)
Leslie Ross (Legal Counsel)
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

Board Members Absent

Maddalena Savary
Joshua W. Carden

a. Call to Order.

Karen Hartman-Tellez called the meeting to order at 12:33 p.m. The meeting took place via Zoom.

b. Preliminary Remarks.

Karen Hartman-Tellez greeted the members.

c. Approval of Meeting Minutes of May 14, 2021.

Moses Sanchez moved to approve the meeting minutes from May 14, 2021. Grant Frazier seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

d. Housing Presentation from Arizona Center for Disability Law.

Rose Daley Rooney presented current issues in Fair Housing to the Board.

e. Division Report.

Rebekah Browder gave the Division Report. Ms. Browder updated the Board on current litigation.

f. Call to the Public.

No members of the public addressed the Board.

g. Project ideas.

Discussion was held about ongoing project ideas.

- COVID issues in Housing: Members of the Board discussed broadening the topic to housing issues that the pandemic seemed to exacerbate. Tarah White moved for the Board to invite the Chris Groninger from the Arizona Bar Foundation to present to the Board at a future meeting. Grant Frazier seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.
- GINA and Employee Wellness Programs: brief discussion was held and the issue was tabled for a future meeting.
- Encounters between the public and members of Law Enforcement: the Board discussed the pending analysis of the data collected in the Law Enforcement Survey.
- The Board did not take action on the other project ideas and were tabled for a future meeting.

h. Call to the Board.

There were no current events discussed by the Board.

i. Adjournment.

Tarah White moved to adjourn the meeting, and Moses Sanchez seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 1:27 p.m.

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of Public Meeting
June 11, 2021

Board Members Present by Zoom

Karen J. Hartman-Tellez (Chairperson)
Tarah White (Vice-Chairperson)
Carol Berry
Grant H. Frazier
Moses Sanchez
Maddalena Savary

Staff Members Present by Zoom

Rebekah Browder (Executive Director)
Leslie Ross (Legal Counsel)
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

Board Members Absent

Joshua W. Carden

a. Call to Order.

Karen Hartman-Tellez called the meeting to order at 12:31 p.m. The meeting took place via Zoom.

b. Preliminary Remarks.

Karen Hartman-Tellez greeted the members and greeted Chris Groninger from the Arizona Bar Foundation who was also present.

c. Approval of Meeting Minutes of May 14, 2021.

Moses Sanchez moved to approve the meeting minutes from May 14, 2021. Tarah White seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

d. Division Report.

Rebekah Browder gave the Division Report. The Division has seen a large number of public accommodations cases involving mask requirements.

e. Call to the Public.

No members of the public addressed the Board.

f. Project ideas.

Discussion was held about ongoing project ideas.

- Assistance/service animals in public accommodations and housing: Tarah White moved to submit entity names for receipt of the drafted small business association letter to offer training opportunities regarding service animals to small businesses. Grant Frazier seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- The Board did not act on the other project ideas and projects were tabled for a future meeting.

g. Call to the Board.

The Board agreed there would be no July meeting due to summer vacations.

h. Adjournment.

Tarah White moved to adjourn the meeting, and Moses Sanchez seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 1:13 p.m.

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of Public Meeting

August 20, 2021

Board Members Present by Zoom

Karen J. Hartman-Tellez (Chairperson)
Grant H. Frazier
Moses Sanchez
Maddalena Savary

Staff Members Present by Zoom

Rebekah Browder (Executive Director)
Leslie Ross (Legal Counsel)
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

Board Members Absent

Tarah White (Vice-Chairperson)
Carol Berry
Joshua W. Carden

a. Call to Order.

Karen Hartman-Tellez called the meeting to order at 12:33 p.m. The meeting took place via Zoom.

b. Preliminary Remarks.

Karen Hartman-Tellez greeted the members and invited Maddalena Savary to speak. Ms. Savary announced she resigned from the Board due to a conflict with her new job at the Arizona Supreme Court.

c. Approval of Meeting Minutes of June 11, 2021.

Moses Sanchez moved to approve the meeting minutes from June 11, 2021. Grant Frazier seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

d. Division Report.

Rebekah Browder gave the Division Report. The Division reported a high number of employment vaccine requirement complaints, as well as a number of public accommodations cases involving mask requirements.

e. Call to the Public.

No members of the public were present.

f. Project ideas.

Discussion was held about ongoing project ideas.

- Issues in housing: Chris Groninger from the Arizona Bar Foundation will present at the next meeting.
- Encounters with the Public and Law Enforcement: The Board discussed individuals to invite to speak about the topic at a future meeting.

g. Call to the Board.

The Division will participate in a Fair Housing CLE with the State Bar on September 15, 2021.

h. Adjournment.

Grant Frazier moved to adjourn the meeting, and Moses Sanchez seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 12:55 p.m.

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of Public Meeting
October 8, 2021

Board Members Present by Zoom

Karen J. Hartman-Tellez (Chairperson)
Tarah White (Vice-Chairperson)
Carol Berry
Joshua W. Carden
Grant H. Frazier
Moses Sanchez

Staff Members Present by Zoom

Rebekah Browder (Executive Director)
Leslie Ross (Legal Counsel)
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

a. Call to Order.

Karen Hartman-Tellez called the meeting to order at 12:34 p.m. The meeting took place via Zoom.

b. Preliminary Remarks.

Karen Hartman-Tellez greeted the members.

c. Approval of Meeting Minutes of August 20, 2021.

Grant Frazier moved to approve the meeting minutes from August 20, 2021. Moses Sanchez seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

d. Division Report.

Rebekah Browder gave the Division Report. The Division reported a high number of employment vaccine requirement complaints.

e. Call to the Public.

No members of the public were present.

f. Project ideas.

Discussion was held about ongoing project ideas.

- Issues in housing: Chris Groninger from the Arizona Bar Foundation will present at the next meeting.
- Encounters with the Public and Law Enforcement: The Board discussed individuals to invite to speak about the topic at a future meeting.
- Law Enforcement Survey Status: Joshua Carden and Tarah White plan to get the results compiled and present them to the Board for action in January 2022.
- The Board discussed adding vaccine related issues to November's agenda.

g. Call to the Board.

Nothing to report.

h. Adjournment.

Joshua Carden moved to adjourn the meeting, and Moses Sanchez seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 1:00 p.m.

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of Public Meeting

November 12, 2021

Board Members Present by Zoom

Karen J. Hartman-Tellez (Chairperson)
Tarah White (Vice-Chairperson)
Carol Berry
Grant H. Frazier

Staff Members Present by Zoom

Leslie Ross (Legal Counsel)
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

a. Call to Order.

Karen Hartman-Tellez called the meeting to order at 12:30 p.m. The meeting took place via Zoom.

b. Preliminary Remarks.

Karen Hartman-Tellez greeted the members.

c. Approval of Meeting Minutes of October 8, 2021.

Tarah White moved to approve the meeting minutes from October 8, 2021. Grant Frazier seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

d. Presentation from Chris Groninger, Arizona Bar Foundation

Chris Groninger presented on the current state of evictions in Arizona and the resources available to housing providers and tenants.

e. Division Report.

Leslie Ross gave the Division Report. The Division reported significant increase in employment intakes relating to COVID-19 vaccine requirements. The Division hired two new compliance officers in the Tucson office and will be hiring a third.

f. Call to the Public.

No members of the public were present.

g. Project ideas.

Discussion was held about ongoing project ideas.

- COVID-19 Vaccine related issues – the Board discussed waiting to see what happens with the court challenges to vaccine mandates.
- Assistance/service animals in public accommodations and housing – The Board discussed Chris Groninger's request to provide legal information about service animals on the Arizona Bar Foundation's eviction website.
- Encounters with the Public and Law Enforcement: The Board discussed inviting individuals to a future meeting on the topics of ASU's de-escalation training with the City of Tempe and peaceful protests.

h. Call to the Board.

Nothing to report.

i. Adjournment.

Tarah White moved to adjourn the meeting, and Grant Frazier seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 1:21 p.m.

ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of Public Meeting
December 10, 2021

Board Members Present by Zoom
Tarah White (Vice-Chairperson)
Joshua W. Carden
Grant H. Frazier
Moses Sanchez

Staff Members Present by Zoom
Leslie Ross (Legal Counsel)
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

Board Members Absent
Karen J. Hartman-Tellez (Chairperson)
Carol Berry

a. Call to Order.

Tarah White called the meeting to order at 12:33 p.m. The meeting took place via Zoom.

b. Preliminary Remarks.

Tarah White greeted the members.

c. Approval of Meeting Minutes of November 12, 2021.

Grant Frazier moved to approve the meeting minutes from November 12, 2021. Tarah White seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

d. Division Report.

Leslie Ross gave the Division Report on behalf of Rebekah Browder. The Division reported an increase in complaints filed with the Division. The Division further reported on compliance officer position vacancies and new hires.

e. Call to the Public.

No members of the public were present.

f. Project ideas.

Discussion was held about ongoing project ideas.

- COVID-19 Vaccine related issues: The Board discussed the legal uncertainty regarding the employment and housing issues pertaining to COVID-19.
- Assistance/service animals in public accommodations and housing: The Board discussed its status of attempts to communicate training opportunities with the restaurant association. The Board discussed creating small recorded presentations on service animals and requested a Division presentation for the Board.
- Encounters with the Public and Law Enforcement: The Board discussed the status of pending invitations to community members.

g. Call to the Board.

Joshua Carden discussed interests in having civil rights practitioners and experts present on voting rights in a future meeting on the topics of voting rights act and election law. The Board also discussed having an expert present on Section 36, Article 2 of the Arizona Constitution.

h. Adjournment.

Joshua Carden moved to adjourn the meeting, and Moses Sanchez seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 1:08 p.m.