

**ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD**

Minutes of Public Meeting

January 19, 2018

Board Members Present

Joshua Carden (Vice Chairperson)

Kathryn King (Member)

Sandy Flynn (Member)

Tarah L. White (Member)

Rachel Johnson (Member)

Robert Garcia (Member)

Staff Members Present

Rebekah Browder

Tina Rohe

Staff Members Present by telephone

Vincent Sottosanti

**I. Call to Order**

Joshua Carden called the meeting to order at 12:32 p.m., with the members present announcing. The meeting took place at 2005 North Central, Arizona Attorney General First Floor Conference Room, Phoenix, Arizona.

**II. Preliminary Remarks**

Joshua Carden greeted the members and requested we take one item out of order in order to accommodate members who had to leave early.

**III. Scheduled Meeting Times**

Item VIII was taken out of order. After some discussion, Kathryn King made a motion to have regularly scheduled Board meetings on the first Friday of each month at 12:30 p.m. Tarah White seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**IV. Minutes**

Joshua Carden moved to approve the minutes of the November 7, 2017 meeting subject to one date correction. Robert Garcia seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**V. Division Report**

Executive Director Rebekah Browder advised the Board of Civil Rights Division's sunset review process, *State v. Geo Group* settlement agreement, new staff members, and pending litigation.

## **VI. Update on Pending Issues**

Robert Garcia moved to present former Chairperson of the Board, Howard Meyers, a certificate of service for his work on the Board. Kathryn King seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

## **VII. Board Elections**

After some discussion, Joshua Carden expressed interest in the Chairperson position. Robert Garcia expressed interest in the Vice-Chairperson position. Kathryn King expressed interest to run for the Vice-Chairperson position the following year. Rachel Johnson moved to elect Joshua Carden Chairperson and Robert Garcia Vice-Chairperson. Kathryn King seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

## **VIII. Planning: New and Pending Civil Rights Topics**

The Board discussed the potential topic areas were mentioned at the last meeting. The Board will take action on the following items:

1. Kathryn King is working on a sexual harassment panel with the Arizona State Bar that will take place on April 5, 2018. Ms. King suggested the Attorney General's Office help publicize the panel and asked Ms. Browder to follow up on it.
2. Regarding working with the corporation commission, Kathryn King, Joshua Carden, and Rachel Johnson will reach out to see what the Board can do to assist notifying small businesses of sexual harassment laws.
3. Discussion was also held about the suggestion for the Board to conduct a survey about the lack of minorities and women in top positions in law enforcement. Ms. King said she would be willing to put one together for the Board's discussion.

The rest of the potential Board focus areas were tabled for the moment with the intent for the Board to discuss them and take action on a later date.

## **IX. Call to Public**

Two members of the public were present. No members of the public addressed the Board.

## **X. Announcements and Current Events**

Rebekah Browder discussed her participation in the Arizona Capitol Times Webinar about workplace discrimination.

## **XI. Adjournment**

There being no other announcements or matters, Kathryn King moved to adjourn the meeting at 1:26 p.m.. Tarah White seconded the motion, and the meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.

**ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD**

Minutes of Public Meeting

February 2, 2018

Board Members Present

Joshua Carden (Chairperson)

Tarah L. White (Member)

Board Members Present by Telephone

Robert Garcia (Vice-Chairperson)

Rachel Johnson (Member)

Christopher St. John (Member)

Staff Members Present

Rebekah Browder

Tina Rohe

Staff Members Present by Telephone

Vincent Sottosanti

**I. Call to Order**

Joshua Carden called the meeting to order at 12:35 p.m., with the members present announcing. The meeting took place at 2005 North Central, Arizona Attorney General Third Floor Conference Room, Phoenix, Arizona.

**II. Preliminary Remarks**

Joshua Carden greeted the members and made preliminary remarks on the expulsion of Don Shooter from the Arizona House of Representatives noting the timeliness of the Board addressing the issue of sexual harassment.

**III. Minutes**

Tarah White moved to approve the minutes of the January 19, 2018 meeting. Rachel Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**IV. Division Report**

Executive Director Rebekah Browder advised the Board of Civil Rights Division's sunset review status.

**V. Update on Pending Issues**

- a. Law Enforcement Survey: Kathryn King created a law enforcement survey. The discussion on this topic was tabled until the next meeting.
- b. Corporation Commission Sexual Harassment Information Sheet: Kathryn King and Joshua Carden created a short information sheet for the Arizona Corporation Commission to address sexual harassment laws for employers with less than 15

employees. Tarah White moved to recommend the document to the Corporation Commission with the words "Sexual Harassment" capitalized. Robert Garcia seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

- c. Proposed Legislation on Civil Remedies for Human Trafficking Victims: nothing has progressed on this point due to the current legislative session. Tarah White, Robert Garcia, and Rachel Johnson request to attend the meeting with the legislative council when it occurs. The date of the meeting will be determined at a later time.
- d. Howard Meyers Certificate of Appreciation: Joshua Carden signed the certificate and it will be sent to Mr. Meyers.

#### **VI. Call to Public**

Two members of the public were present. No members of the public addressed the Board.

#### **VII. Announcements and Current Events**

- a. Tarah White discussed the passing of Bishop Thomas and discussion of sending an appreciation letter or certificate for his parish and family. The Board will address this at the next meeting.
- b. Rebekah Browder discussed a number of upcoming events:
  - i. April 5, 2018: Sexual Harassment Webinar with the Arizona State Bar.
  - ii. April 27, 2018: Arizona Fair Housing Partnership fair housing seminar at Ability 360.
  - iii. March 9, 2018: United States Commission on Civil Rights will hear testimony on Voting Rights in Arizona at ASU College of Law.
- c. Discussion about open meeting law violations if more than 3 members of the Board attend these events. Vincent Sottosanti said he would look into the issue.

#### **VIII. Adjournment**

There being no other announcements or matters, Tarah White moved to adjourn the meeting at 1:07 p.m. Christopher St. John seconded the motion, and the meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.

#6851790

## **ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD**

### **Minutes of Public Meeting**

**March 2, 2018**

#### **Board Members Present**

Joshua W. Carden (Chairperson)

Tarah L. White (Member)

Sandy F. Flynn (Member)

Rachel F. Johnson (Member)

#### **Board Members Present by Telephone**

Robert M. Garcia (Vice-Chairperson)

Christopher St. John (Member)

Kathryn Hackett King (Member)

#### **Staff Members Present**

Angelina Nguyen

Tina Rohe

#### **Staff Members Absent**

Rebekah Browder

#### **Staff Members Present by Telephone**

Vincent Sottosanti

### **I. Call to Order**

Joshua Carden called the meeting to order at 12:35 p.m., with the members present announcing. The meeting took place at 2005 North Central, Arizona Attorney General, Third Floor Conference Room, Phoenix, Arizona.

### **II. Preliminary Remarks**

Joshua Carden greeted the members in person and by phone. Joshua Carden introduced Angelina Nguyen, who would be filling in for Rebekah Browder, who was absent for today's meeting.

### **III. Minutes**

Tarah White moved to approve the minutes of the February 2, 2018 meeting. Christopher St. John seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

### **IV. Division Report**

Angelina Nguyen advised the Board of Arizona Civil Rights Advisory Board sunset review status and the passage HB2019 by the Senate Judiciary Committee.

### **V. Update on Pending Issues**

- a. Discussion was held about open meeting law and board members attending public events in a possible quorum setting. Posting these events will assure the public that no board action will be taken at these events. Ms. Nguyen discussed that it was not required by open meeting law to post the public notice, but permissive and a best practice. Several forms used by other 3 cities in the State of Arizona were circulated via

email to the board members before the meeting by Tina Rohe. Joshua Carden discussed the different forms and the board decided that the City of Peoria form be formatted to be used by the board and posted monthly. Joshua Carden entertained a motion to accept the City of Peoria form for the Board events. Rachel Johnson moved and Sandy Flynn seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

- b. Law Enforcement Survey: Kathryn King created a draft law enforcement survey about minorities in managerial positions. Discussion was held about the survey and comments were made by board members. Discussion was held about possible online platform to gather the results of the survey and possibly holding a public forum for upper management in law enforcement departments to help disseminate the survey and link to the online platform. Sandy Flynn volunteered to look into online survey companies and report back to the board. Joshua Carden asked for volunteers to assist Kathryn King on the draft survey and board members Rachel Johnson and Tarah White agreed to assist. Joshua Carden moved to table the law enforcement survey until the next meeting and Tarah White seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- c. Tarah White discussed sending an appreciation letter for the parish and family of Bishop Alexis Thomas who was a prominent figure in Civil Rights and had recently passed away. Ms. White circulated a draft of the letter to the Board. Joshua Carden read the draft letter to those board members attending via telephone. Discussion was held about the draft letter and suggestions were made by board members. Joshua Carden heard from Rebekah Browder that the Attorney General may want to also join in the letter. Joshua Carden talked about circulating a letter to Tina Rohe for signature by Mr. Carden and listing all board members below his name, by March 16. Tarah White moved to submit a draft by March 16 and Rachel Johnson seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

#### **VI. Call to Public**

No members of the public were present.

#### **VII. Announcements and Current Events**

- a. Angelina Nguyen discussed an upcoming event:
  - i. March 9, 2018: United States Commission on Civil Rights will hear testimony on Voting Rights at ASU College of Law and a flyer/handout was given about the event.
- b. Tarah White spoke about meetings about homelessness and report to be put out by the Department of Housing. Joshua Carden will put on next agenda.

#### **VIII. Adjournment**

There being no other announcements or matters, Rachel Johnson moved to adjourn the meeting at 1:25 p.m. Tarah White seconded the motion, and the meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.

#6851790

# APPROVED

## ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of Public Meeting

April 6, 2018

### Board Members Present

Joshua W. Carden (Chairperson)

Tarah L. White (Member)

### Board Members Present by Telephone

Sandy F. Flynn (Member)

Kathryn Hackett King (Member)

Rachel F. Johnson (Member)

### Board Members Absent

Robert M. Garcia (Vice-Chairperson)

Christopher St. John (Member)

### Staff Members Present

Rebekah Browder

Tina Rohe

Daniel Nies

### Staff Members Present by Telephone

Vincent Sottosanti

#### **I. Call to Order**

Joshua Carden called the meeting to order at 12:33 p.m., with the members present announcing. The meeting took place at 2005 North Central, Arizona Attorney General, Third Floor Conference Room, Phoenix, Arizona.

#### **II. Preliminary Remarks**

Joshua Carden greeted the members in person and by phone.

#### **III. Minutes**

Tarah White moved to approve the minutes of the March 2, 2018 meeting. Kathryn King seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

#### **IV. Division Report**

Rebekah Browder advised the Board that Arizona Civil Rights Advisory Board was renewed for 8 years, and the bill was signed by Governor Ducey on March 16, 2018.

Ms. Browder presented at a Sexual Harassment CLE at the State Bar and Kate King was the moderator.

Ms. Browder also told the board about 2 sexual harassment cases, of less than 15 employees, that the division filed defaults with court last week.

# APPROVED

## **V. Update on Pending Issues**

- a. Law Enforcement Survey: Kathryn King created a draft law enforcement survey about minorities in managerial positions. Discussion was held about changing the wording in the introductory paragraph and the Board agreed on the changes. The Board discussed the goal of the survey was to later use the survey results to launch bigger ideas such as assist in recommending training for police officers with regard to dealing with the homeless population as well as transgender issues. Joshua Carden asked the ACRD staff to see if there is a way to get an ACRA B Surveys email account using the azag.gov domain. Rebekah Browder said she would check on this issue. The Board decided the revised draft should be circulated amongst law enforcement agencies to get feedback. Tarah White moved to use the draft survey with the revised first paragraph. Rachel Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.
- b. HUD Homelessness Report: Tarah White updated the Board on the homelessness survey. The City of Phoenix is currently gathering information, and ACRA B should be able to get the statistics from their data collection. Based on the report data, ACRA B may follow up or take some sort of action. Tarah White will update at the next meeting.

## **VI. Call to Public**

No members of the public were present.

## **VII. Announcements and Current Events**

- a. Joshua Carden advised the Board the letter was sent to Bishop Thomas' family and congregation.
- b. Rebekah Browder discussed an upcoming event:
  - i. April 27, 2018 Fair Housing Event at Ability 360. Tina Rohe will send the invitation to the Board members.

## **VIII. Adjournment**

There being no other announcements or matters, Rachel Johnson moved to adjourn the meeting at 1:10 p.m. Tarah White seconded the motion, and the meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.

**ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD**

Minutes of Public Meeting

June 1, 2018

Board Members Present

Joshua W. Carden (Chairperson)  
Kathryn Hackett King (Member)  
Tarah L. White (Member)

Staff Members Present

Rebekah Browder  
Tina Rohe

Staff Members Present by Telephone

Vincent Sottosanti

Board Members Present by Telephone

Robert M. Garcia (Vice-Chairperson)

**I. Call to Order**

Joshua Carden called the meeting to order at 12:11 p.m., with the members present announcing. The meeting took place at 2005 North Central, Arizona Attorney General, Third Floor Conference Room, Phoenix, Arizona.

**II. Preliminary Remarks**

Joshua Carden greeted the members. Brief discussion was held to skip the July 2018 meeting due to lack of a quorum. Mr. Carden said the State Bar Association revealed from an internal survey 40% of all lawyers respondents and 70% of all women respondents have been subject to sexual harassment in the workplace. Mr. Carden concluded the sexual harassment issue is not going away any time soon. Kathryn Hackett King mentioned a pending rule of professional conduct before the Arizona Supreme Court to specifically prohibit sexual harassment. After an inquiry from Mr. Carden to see if the comment period was still open, Rebekah Browder informed the Board that public comment closed on May 21, 2018.

**III. Minutes**

Kathryn Hackett King moved to approve the minutes of the March 2, 2018 meeting. Tarah White seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**IV. Division Report**

Rebekah Browder informed the Board the Arizona Civil Rights Division still has five pending cases in litigation, and the Division is getting close to settling one case. Ms. Browder noted that a large number of Division employees attended the Arizona Fair Housing Seminar in April, "50 Years of Fair Housing."

**V. Update on Pending Issues**

- a. Robert Garcia asked if any of the Board was aware of the large age discrimination case involving the company Intel. Vincent Sottosanti informed the Board the case is being litigated by the EEOC.

## **VI. Law Enforcement Survey and ACRA B Surveys Email Account**

- a. Rebekah Browder reported the azag.gov email address is set up: acrabssurveys@azag.gov. Ms. Browder said that she, Tina Rohe, and Mr. Sottosanti will have access to the account. Ms. Rohe said that she had been working on a list of law enforcement contacts for purpose of distributing the survey. No Board members had the opportunity to discuss the draft survey with their law enforcement contacts. Joshua Carden suggested the members of the Board vet the draft survey with their law enforcement contacts and get feedback. Kathryn Hackett King and Robert Garcia said they would talk to their contacts before the next meeting.

## **VII. Status of Report on Homelessness**

- a. Tarah White updated the Board on the homelessness survey. Ms. White informed the Board regarding the Phoenix Cares program, where a person can call the number with information regarding a homeless person and someone would respond within 3-5 days. The Phoenix Cares program has received over 1,200 calls in the last three months and has identified over 500 homeless encampments. Of the 399 cases referred to the Human Services Department, 277 cases accepted help, and 10% moved into permanent housing. Ms. White advised Maricopa County does a point in time survey to count the number of homeless. The statistics revealed:

2017: 5,605 homeless individuals in Maricopa County, with 3,546 sheltered.

2018: 6,298 homeless individuals in Maricopa County, with 3,680 sheltered (increase of 12% homelessness rate).

An increase in youth and family homelessness was also noted. From 2015 through 2017, there has been an increase in homelessness by 59%. Issues that are unresolved: (1) Are people being turned away from shelters? If so, why?; and (2) are there any barriers for people not getting their basic needs (food and water) met? Ms. White plans to reach out to the Human Services Director to find out if services are equitable and accessible to everyone. Ms. White also mentioned that some shelters will not take men or boys over a certain age due to the issue of domestic violence.

- b. Joshua Carden mentioned that he was curious to find out what the genders were for the sheltered vs. unsheltered. Kathryn Hackett King was wondering what type of population of the homeless were increasing and where they came from. Ms. King mentioned that the Mayor in Albuquerque has a program where individuals drive around looking for homeless people and offered them a job. Robert Garcia said the City of Phoenix contracts with Community Bridges, Inc. ("CBI") who makes contact with individuals and may have information helpful to the Board. Mr. Garcia said he would get Ms. White the contact information for CBI.

## **VIII. Mid-year review of potential and current project ideas**

- a. Joshua Carden commented the Board has made progress on and/or finished three of the seven projects the Board had initially wanted to work on. Mr. Carden wants to prioritize the Human Trafficking Legislation. Kathryn Hackett King suggested setting up meetings with the legislators after election season. The Board agreed to think up proposed language and put proposed language on a future meeting's agenda. Discussion about potential stakeholders was held. The Board's goal is to make proposal to legislators and then get stakeholders involved. Discussion was held to add to the next Board meeting's agenda an item for any other project ideas the Board may want to address.

**IX. Call to Public**

No members of the public were present.

**X. Announcements and Current Events**

- a. Rebekah Browder discussed an upcoming event:
  - i. Religious Liberty CLE at the State Bar Conference on June 29, 2018.Ms. Browder also mentioned that she will be attending the annual EEOC conference in June. Due to the understaffed EEOC, Ms. Browder mentioned the Division has seen an uptick in charging parties using our Division to file discrimination charges. Unit Chief of the Division, Angelina Nguyen, will be attending the annual HUD conference in September.
- b. Joshua Carden suggested skipping the July meeting due to lack of a quorum, and therefore the meeting would be on August 3, 2018. There was no opposition. Mr. Carden requested staff to send the Board unapproved minutes when typed up.

**XI. Adjournment**

There being no other announcements or matters, Tarah White moved to adjourn the meeting at 12:53 p.m. Robert Garcia seconded the motion, and the meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.

#7087862

## **ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD**

### **Minutes of Public Meeting**

August 3, 2018

#### **Board Members Present**

Joshua W. Carden (Chairperson)  
Rachel Frazier Johnson (Member)  
Christopher St. John (Member)

#### **Staff Members Present**

Rebekah Browder  
Tina Rohe

#### **Staff Members Present by Telephone**

Vincent Sottosanti

#### **Board Members Present by Telephone**

Sandy F. Flynn (Member)

#### **Board Members Absent**

Robert M. Garcia (Vice-Chairperson)  
Kathryn Hackett King (Member)  
Tarah L. White (Member)

### **I. Call to Order**

Joshua Carden called the meeting to order at 12:54 p.m., with the members present announcing. The meeting took place at the Arizona Attorney General's Office, 2005 North Central, Third Floor Conference Room, Phoenix, Arizona.

### **II. Preliminary Remarks**

Joshua Carden greeted the members. Brief discussion was held about absent board members and that the members were thankful to have a quorum.

### **III. Minutes**

Christopher St. John moved to approve the minutes of the June 1, 2018 meeting. Rachel Frazier Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

### **IV. Division Report**

Rebekah Browder informed the Board the Arizona Civil Rights Division of Unit Chief Angelina Nguyen presented at a recent ADA event at Ability 360. She also reported the Division has four pending cases in litigation, but two cases will be dismissed due to recent settlements. Ms. Browder noted that the recent Housing and Urban Development on site visit of the Division in Phoenix and Tucson went well.

### **V. Update on Pending Issues**

Pending issues could not be discussed due to absent Board Members. Joshua Carden moved to table agenda items F, G, and H until the next meeting due to the absence of Board Members. Rachel Frazier Johnson seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

## **VI. Call to the Board**

The Call to the Board agenda item was explained by Joshua Carden. He stated that any Board Member could talk about public events but could not take action on the item. He desired to see this topic item for each Board Meeting.

## **VII. Project ideas**

Joshua Carden asked for more project ideas from the Board. Rachel Frazier Johnson noted the three main issues of homelessness survey, human trafficking legislation, and law enforcement surveys were moving forward. Ms. Frazier Johnson stated the Board was moving in the right direction and wants discussion on where the Board would move next. Mr. Carden agreed and looks forward to new opportunities for the Board and wanted the minutes to reflect that desire.

## **VIII. Call to Public**

No members of the public were present.

## **IX. Announcements and Current Events**

Christopher St. John asked Rebekah Browder about the “me too” movement and whether the Division has seen more charges of sexual harassment. Ms. Browder reported the numbers from the last fiscal year, which included:

- a. Employment discrimination allegations: significant increase in disability discrimination, sex discrimination, and retaliation charges from the previous year. Age and race discrimination allegations had a small increase.
- b. Housing discrimination allegations: consistently see disability discrimination complaints as the most common charge filed.
- c. Public Accommodations discrimination allegations: relatively remained consistent for the last two years.
- d. Arizonans with Disability Act allegations: also relatively consistent for the last two years.

Ms. Browder informed the Board the FY2018 numbers will be reported in the annual report that would be released in the fall. Rachel Frazier Johnson inquired as to whether the Board could get a copy of the annual report to the members. Tina Rohe stated she would send it out.

Rachel Frazier Johnson asked for the Board to follow up on the law enforcement survey and the interest of chiefs of police to be involved with the law enforcement survey.

Sandy Flynn requested staff members to get a list of the Board focus areas. Joshua Carden requested staff to send out the list again to the members.

**X. Adjournment**

There being no other announcements or matters, Rachel Frazier Johnson moved to adjourn the meeting at 1:11 p.m. Christopher St. John seconded the motion, and the meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.

#7226182

## **ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD**

### Minutes of Public Meeting

September 7, 2018

#### **Board Members Present**

Joshua W. Carden (Chairperson)  
Kathryn Hackett King (Member)  
Tarah L. White (Member)  
Rachel Frazier Johnson (Member)  
Christopher St. John (Member)

#### **Staff Members Present**

Rebekah Browder (Executive Director)  
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

#### **Staff Members Present by Telephone**

Vincent Sottosanti (Legal Counsel)

#### **Board Members Absent**

Robert M. Garcia (Vice-Chairperson)  
Sandy F. Flynn (Member)

#### **I. Call to Order**

Joshua Carden called the meeting to order at 12:35 p.m., with the members present announcing. The meeting took place at 2005 North Central, Arizona Attorney General, Third Floor Conference Room, Phoenix, Arizona.

#### **II. Preliminary Remarks**

Joshua Carden greeted the members. There were no preliminary remarks.

#### **III. Minutes**

Christopher St. John moved to approve the minutes of the August 3, 2018 meeting. Joshua Carden seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

#### **IV. Division Report**

Rebekah Browder informed the Board the Arizona Civil Rights Division currently has two cases in litigation in Tucson. Ms. Browder noted that the division had a compliance officer resign in Phoenix and has done a direct hire to replace the vacant position with a former EEOC investigator that starts on Monday. Also, the division has decided to move one vacant litigation attorney position from Phoenix to Tucson.

#### **V. Update on Pending Issues**

Joshua Carden talked about tabled items from the last meeting and asked the Board to hold off in the discussion of the Law Enforcement Survey until Rachel Frazier Johnson arrived at the meeting.

#### **VI. Status of tabled items from last meeting.**

##### **a. Homelessness Survey.**

Tarah White has not heard anything on the homelessness survey and suggested we draft a letter to the Phoenix housing department to request the information the Board would like to receive. Ms. White would possibly like to invite them to a future meeting and volunteered to draft the letter for the requested information. This item will be tabled pending this draft letter until the next meeting.

**b. Contact Information with Community Bridges.**

Joshua Carden suggested this agenda item be tabled since Mr. Garcia was not in attendance and also suggested a staff member contact Mr. Garcia for a written report with this information and/or have another board member contact him, if appropriate. Legal Counsel Vincent Sottosanti said that a board member could contact Mr. Garcia without a quorum of the board to request the information.

**c. Draft Law Enforcement Survey.**

Kathryn Hackett King circulated the response from DPS to the law enforcement survey. The only change DPS suggested was the removal of the word “children” from item “4” of the survey. Joshua Carden suggested that the board wait until other comments are received from other agencies before finalizing the survey.

Discussion was held about which law enforcement agencies would be invited to the board meeting. Tina Rohe discussed the compilation of lists of law enforcement police chiefs and sheriffs from the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and will send the contact list out to board members. Discussion was held as to the November meeting’s location and logistics. It was decided that Noon would be the best option for higher attendance. Mr. Carden commented that every effort should be made to accommodate agencies in other parts of the state to make it easier to have a maximum turnout for the meeting. Ms. Browder commented that we would have to contact the AG technology department to find out what is available for alternative AG sites to be able to hook in for the meeting. Joshua Carden will send a draft invitation to Kathryn Hackett King to give feedback on the invitation. Rachel Frazier Johnson asked if we could get a sponsor to provide lunch. Rebekah Browder will check on the policy in providing lunch or beverages to attendees. Joshua Carden said the meeting would be for presentation of the survey to law enforcement agencies to get feedback on it.

**VII. Auditor General Report.**

Joshua Carden talked about the information that the Arizona Auditor General would like to receive regarding how the board members are paid for their time and any reimbursements to the board members for travel. The Auditor General requests a per diem and expense policy on how the ACRA board members are paid and further discussion was held to discuss the requirements for the report that includes the statutory guidelines. There is currently no per diem or reimbursement policy on the books for the Board. Samples were circulated via email for other State Boards policies. Joshua Carden volunteered to draft the policy and asked other board members to help with the draft. Tarah White and Rachel Frazier Johnson volunteered to help draft the policy including per diem and expense reimbursement policy for the Board.

**VIII. Status of any new project ideas from the Board**

Kathryn Hackett King suggested a meeting with legislators to create civil remedies for human trafficking. She suggested that the board wait until the November 6<sup>th</sup> election. Discussion was held as to which representatives may be interested in sponsor the legislation. Discussion was held about legislative counsel and creating draft language for civil remedies for human trafficking. Kathryn Hackett King will put together proposed language on civil remedies for human trafficking. Joshua Carden mentioned December meeting as the possible goal for legislative language.

Tarah White discussed peaceful protests and the attendance Special Commander Andre Anderson at a past board meeting and him possibly presenting at the law enforcement meeting to talk to other agencies about providing training on peaceful protests. Discussion was held about timing of presenting further training on peaceful protests to members of the public. Motion was made to have Andre Anderson present on peaceful protests, Tarah White seconded, the motion passed unanimously. Joshua Carden volunteered to contact Commander Anderson to speak at the law enforcement meeting.

**IX. Call to Public**

No members of the public were present.

**X. Call to the Board – Current Events Summary**

- a. September 13, 2018, Truckers Against Trafficking, Briefing on Commercial Sexual Exploitation, 10:00a – 2:00p, Knight Transportation Headquarters.
- b. September 12 – 14, 2018, 9:00a – 4:00p each day, Arizona Black Law Enforcement Employees (A.B.L.E.) Information & Expectations: The Community and the Criminal Justice System, Mesa Community College.

Tina Rohe will put the above information on the ACRA website as public events which the board may attend.

**XI. Adjournment**

There being no other announcements or matters, Kathryn Hackett King moved to adjourn the meeting at 1:36 p.m., Rachel Frazier Johnson seconded the motion, and the meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.

#7306377

## **ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD**

### **Minutes of Public Meeting**

**October 5, 2018**

#### **Board Members Present**

Joshua W. Carden (Chairperson)  
Robert M. Garcia (Vice-Chairperson)  
Sandy F. Flynn (Member)  
Tarah L. White (Member)

#### **Board Members Absent**

Kathryn Hackett King (Member)  
Christopher St. John (Member)

#### **Staff Members Present**

Rebekah Browder (Executive Director)  
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

#### **Staff Members Present by Telephone**

Vincent Sottosanti (Legal Counsel)

#### **Board Members Present By Telephone**

Rachel Frazier Johnson (Member)

#### **a. Call to Order**

Joshua Carden called the meeting to order at 12:36 p.m., with the members present announcing. The meeting took place at 2005 North Central, Arizona Attorney General, Third Floor Conference Room, Phoenix, Arizona.

#### **b. Preliminary Remarks**

Joshua Carden greeted the members. There were no preliminary remarks except to issue an apology for the items he failed to complete prior to this meeting.

#### **c. Minutes**

Mr. Carden asked staff to amend the unapproved minutes to add the time of the November meeting. Robert Garcia moved to approve the minutes of the September 7, 2018 meeting, with the change Mr. Carden requested. Tarah White seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

#### **d. Division Report**

Rebekah Browder informed the Board the Arizona Civil Rights Division currently has one litigation case in Tucson and went cause on one case last month. Ms. Browder noted that the division hired a new attorney for Tucson and the Division hired a new compliance officer in Phoenix.

#### **e. Update on Pending Issues**

Joshua Carden moved directly to the action items.

#### **f. Draft Law Enforcement Survey.**

Joshua Carden stated that there were no other changes to the survey suggested by other law enforcement agencies. Discussion was held about the hesitancy of law enforcement personnel to fill out the survey. Rebekah Browder informed the Board that video conferencing is available in Tucson but not Flagstaff. Also, it was suggested by the Executive Office to add the survey to the Attorney General's Office website. Rachel Frazier Johnson motioned to approve the Law Enforcement Survey with the changes discussed the last meeting. Robert Garcia seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Discussion was held regarding the draft invitation for law enforcement. Joshua Carden asked the board to authorize him and Robert Garcia to be able to draft an invitation and give it to staff to send out. Tarah White motioned to authorize and Rachel Frazier Johnson seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Discussion was held for when the link should go up for the website and the list of contacts for who should be invited as well as lunch being provided by Board members. The Board agreed everyone who was on the circulated contact list should be invited. The Board also discussed having the meeting available via WebEx.

Further discussion was held regarding keeping the survey anonymous given that the Attorney General's Office is subject to public records requests. It was decided to password protect the survey to ensure that only law enforcement had access to the survey.

Discussion was held about who from the Board would provide commentary to the Law Enforcement representatives. Robert Garcia, Rachel Frazier Johnson, and Kathryn Hackett King were discussed as possible people to address the attendees.

**g. Homelessness Survey.**

Tarah White drafted a letter to Phoenix Cares and read it aloud to the Board. Discussion was held to changes to the letter and who the letter should be sent to. This item was tabled and Ms. White will have a revised draft for the Board at the next meeting.

**h. Contact Information with Community Bridges.**

Robert Garcia provided a list of contacts/resources that Community Bridges uses in reaching out to the homeless population.

**i. Draft Legislation for a Civil Action for Victims of Human Trafficking**

Kathryn Hackett King drafted proposed legislation regarding human trafficking civil remedies. Discussion was held about potential changes that need to be made to the draft including a statute of limitations. The Board agreed to table the discussion for a future meeting.

**j. Auditor General Report.**

Joshua Carden apologized for not completing the draft the policy regarding per diem compensation for Board members. This item was tabled for a future meeting. Tarah White and Rachel Frazier Johnson will work with Mr. Carden on the policy.

**k. Peaceful Protest Information**

Joshua Carden reached out to Andre Anderson but hasn't heard back from him. He will make more attempts.

**l. Status of any new project ideas from the Board**

- a. Sandy Flynn brought up access to equal education for both charter and public schools. After some discussion as to how this issue would tie into the Board's purpose, two issues could be focused on: transportation and access to school lunches. This issue was tabled for a future meeting and Ms. Flynn will do further research.

- b. Joshua Carden brought up communication issues with those who are in jail and the expenses related to phone calls and video calls. He will look into it further and report back to the Board.

**m. Call to Public**

- a. No members of the public were present.

**n. Call to the Board – Current Events Summary**

- a. October 6, 2018, 9:30 a.m. – 4:00 p.m., Fresh Start Women’s Center has volunteer attorneys to help those in need.
- b. October 23, 2018, 6:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m., ALWAYS Heart of Justice Reception (Justice for Human Trafficking Survivors), Phoenix, Arizona.
- c. November 13-14, 2018, 25<sup>th</sup> Annual Statewide Conference on Affordable Housing and Homelessness, Phoenix, Arizona.

Tina Rohe will put the above information on the ACRA website as public events which the board may attend.

**o. Adjournment**

There being no other announcements or matters, Tarah White to adjourn the meeting at 1:52 p.m., Sandy Flynn seconded the motion, and the meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.

#7365704-v2

## **ARIZONA CIVIL RIGHTS ADVISORY BOARD**

### Minutes of Public Meeting

November 2, 2018

#### **Board Members Present**

Joshua W. Carden (Chairperson)  
Robert M. Garcia (Vice-Chairperson)  
Sandy F. Flynn (Member)  
Tarah L. White (Member)  
Kathryn Hackett King (Member)  
Rachel Frazier Johnson (Member)

#### **Staff Members Present**

Rebekah Browder (Executive Director)  
Tina Rohe (Staff Liaison)

#### **Staff Members Present by Webcast**

Vincent Sottosanti (Legal Counsel)  
Brendan Lenihan (Assistant Attorney General)

#### **Board Members Absent**

Christopher St. John (Member)

#### **a. Call to Order**

Joshua Carden called the meeting to order at 12:05 p.m., with the members present announcing. The meeting took place at 2005 North Central, Office of the Arizona Attorney General, First Floor Training Rooms, Phoenix, Arizona and at simulcast at 416 W. Congress, Arizona Attorney General

#### **b. Preliminary Remarks**

Joshua Carden greeted the members and the members of the public present. Mr. Carden described the Board's mission and background. Attorney General Chief of Staff Michael Bailey spoke on behalf of Arizona Attorney General Mark Brnovich and greeted the Board and the members of law enforcement present expressing his gratitude for all they do.

#### **c. Glendale Police Department Commander Andre Anderson addressed Members and Public**

Commander Anderson discussed peaceful protests related to policing and what can disrupt the community. He said engagement in the community is paramount and leaders need to be able to address civil rights, being ready, communication plans, and ways to address protests as well as issues that may arise. He described the importance of free speech zones, conversations with the public and police, and extreme patience. He stated the biggest obstacle regarding protests and officer safety is respect and relationship with the police and community *prior* to any assaults occurring. Second to that is officer training. Other discussion was held by Commander Anderson and those present at the meeting.

#### **d. Law Enforcement Survey Discussion and Request for Feedback/Call to the Public**

##### **a. Members of the public present:**

##### **Attendees in Phoenix:**

Commander Dave Ramer, Chandler Police Department  
Commander Andre Anderson, Glendale Police Department  
Chief Michael Soelberg, Gilbert Police Department  
Sgt. Michelle Norris, La Paz County  
Chief Steve Stahl, Maricopa Police Department  
Chief Ramon Batista & Patrol Chief Ken Cost, Mesa Police Department  
Officers Trung Tran & Adelbert Caraig, Phoenix Police Department  
Assistant Chief Helen Gándara & Personnel Manager Jill Boehm, Scottsdale Police Dept.  
Commander Randy Rody, Surprise Police Department

##### **Attendees in Tucson:**

Sgt. Carmen Trevizo, Oro Valley Police Department  
Captain Gary Anderson, Pima County Sheriff's Office  
Captain Mark Timpf, Tucson Police Department

- b. Robert Garcia described the purpose and background of the Law Enforcement Survey. The attendees gave feedback and suggestions to the Board about ways to encourage participation as well as other questions to add to the survey.
- e. **Break at 12:51 p.m. Meeting resumed at 1:01 p.m.**
- f. **Law Enforcement Survey Board Discussion**

Rebekah Browder updated the Board on the logistics of the survey. She said the Attorney General's Office IT department can create the survey since surveymonkey.com requires payment. Ms. Browder also informed the Board about some off the record changes requested discussed during the break. Joshua Carden asked staff to incorporate the suggestions made into the current draft of the survey and to send out to Members. Ms. Browder said she would be happy to do so.
- g. **Minutes**

Robert Garcia moved to approve the minutes of the October 5, 2018 meeting. Tarah White seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.
- h. **Draft Legislation for a Civil Action for Victims of Human Trafficking**

Some minor changes were made to the legislation based on discussion at the October 5, 2018 meeting. Tarah White moved to approve the current form of the legislation for circulation. Rachel Frazier Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously. Rebekah Browder was asked to run the legislation by the Attorney General's Office for Feedback. Tarah White said she would ask the Maricopa County Attorney's Office to review. Kathryn Hackett King said she could ask the Arizona Human Trafficking Council to review the legislation. The Board is concerned that the legislation may cause unintended consequences not previously considered. Joshua Carden moved that Ms. Hackett King take the draft for feedback from the Arizona Human Trafficking Council and Ms. White take the draft for feedback from the Maricopa County Attorney's Office. Rachel Frazier Johnson seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- i. **Adjournment**

There being no other announcements or matters, Rachel Frazier Johnson moved to adjourn the meeting at 1:17 p.m., Sandy Flynn seconded the motion, and the meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.